



Girum G. Alemu

Managing Risk and Securing Livelihood

The Karrayu Pastoralists, their Environment
and the Ethiopian State

Geographie

Erdkundliches Wissen – Band 159

Franz Steiner Verlag

Girum G. Alemu
Managing Risk and Securing Livelihood

ERDKUNDLICHES WISSEN

Schriftenreihe für Forschung und Praxis

Begründet von Emil Meynen

Herausgegeben von Martin Coy, Anton Escher und Thomas Krings

Band 159

Girum G. Alemu

Managing Risk and Securing Livelihood

The Karrayu Pastoralists, their Environment
and the Ethiopian State



Franz Steiner Verlag

This work has been published with a kind support of BIGSAS

Umschlagabbildung: Karrayu camel herders near Nazreth/Adama town, Ethiopia.
Photo taken by Girum G. Alemu (2014)

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek:
Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen
Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über
<<http://dnb.d-nb.de>> abrufbar.

Dieses Werk einschließlich aller seiner Teile ist urheberrechtlich geschützt.
Jede Verwertung außerhalb der engen Grenzen des Urheberrechtsgesetzes
ist unzulässig und strafbar.

© Franz Steiner Verlag, Stuttgart 2016

Zugl.: Bayreuth, BIGSAS, Diss., 2014

Druck: Laupp & Göbel GmbH, Gomaringen

Gedruckt auf säurefreiem, alterungsbeständigem Papier.

Printed in Germany.

ISBN 978-3-515-11404-2 (Print)

ISBN 978-3-515-11405-9 (E-Book)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES	9
LIST OF TABLES.....	10
LIST OF PHOTOS	11
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	12
GLOSSARY	14
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	17
ABSTRACT.....	19
ZUSAMMENFASSUNG	21
1. INTRODUCTION	23
1.1 The problematics of the hegemonic adaptation perspective	23
1.2 Apolitical adaptation and pastoralists’ development	25
1.3 Approaching the ‘local contexts’ from a political ecology perspective	28
1.4 Point of departure: risk, resources and relational modes	30
1.5 Organization of the book.....	33
2. ADAPTATION, VULNERABILITY AND LOCAL AGENCY: THEORETICAL AND CONCEPTUAL REFLECTIONS	35
2.1 Introduction	35
2.2 Putting the concept of adaptation in perspective.....	35
2.3 The conventional approach to adaptation	36
2.4 The inadequacy of the conventional approach.....	38
2.5 The concept of vulnerability in adaptation research	39
2.5.1 Socially embedded vulnerability.....	41
2.5.2 Not always passive victims: focus on the locals’ agency	43
2.6 Political ecology and the vulnerability paradigm.....	45
2.7 Locating actors in political ecology	47
2.8 Summary	50
3. RESEARCHING WITH THE LOCALS: METHODOLOGICAL REFLECTIONS	51
3.1 Introduction	51
3.2 Upper Awash valley, Fentalle <i>Woreda</i> : descriptions.....	52

3.2.1 Research area and the people	52
3.2.2 Physical features	54
3.2.3 Micro-climate and seasons	55
3.3 Methodological stances: qualitative approach in geography	56
3.3.1 Qualitative approach	56
3.3.2 Participatory approach	57
3.4 The research process: preliminary visits and initial acquaintance	58
3.4.1 Selecting the units of analysis and study villages	58
3.4.2 Specific research methods employed	60
3.5 Mixing various interview techniques	63
3.6 Field notes and participant observation	66
3.7 Document analysis and secondary information	67
3.8 Analysis and write up	67
3.9 Ethical considerations	68
4. LIVELIHOOD INSECURITY IN CONTEXT: HISTORICAL TRAJECTORIES	70
4.1 Introduction	70
4.2 State-pastoralists relations: ‘development’ and the perils of planning	71
4.2.1 Commercial farms and loss of access to resources	71
4.2.2 Conservation without people	74
4.3 Environmental sources of livelihood risk	79
4.3.1 Water scarcity, frequent drought and food insecurity	79
4.3.2 Pastureland degradation and encroachment of invasive plants	85
4.4 The post-1991 state in pastoral spaces: a liability or an asset?	87
4.4.1 Political reconfiguration and the recognition of a pastoral way of life	87
4.4.2 Transforming the nomads: rationality of state development projects	89
4.5 In-migration and increased population pressure	94
4.6 Summary: multiple sources of livelihood insecurity	97
5. ENVIRONMENTAL TRANSFORMATION AND LIVESTOCK-BASED LIVELIHOOD PRACTICES	100
5.1 Introduction	100
5.2 Environmental transformation and social disorganization	100
5.2.1 Distortion of settlement and mobility patterns	101
5.2.2 Changes in the social fabric	104
5.2.3 Disruption in customary resource management institutions ...	105
5.3 Pastoralists’ agency and response to change	109
5.4 Contexts influencing pastoral mobility decisions	114
5.5 Reorganization: camel-based livelihood practices	117

5.6 Surviving on camels: risk management and livelihood practices	118
5.6.1 Knowledge and herd management	119
5.6.2 Access to browse: the routes of camel mobility	123
5.7 Summary	127
6. LIVING THE TRANSFORMATION: THE MOVE TOWARDS AGRO-PASTORALISM	128
6.1 Introduction	128
6.2 Cultivation as risk management and livelihood practice	128
6.3 Significant aspects influencing decisions to cultivate	130
6.3.1 Disruption of social relations and increase in farming	130
6.3.2 Population pressure, settlement and farming practices	134
6.3.2 Policy factors: irrigation and land certification	136
6.4 Bringing new principles in: fencing communal pasture	141
6.5 Emergence of new arrangements	142
6.5.1 Benefit-sharing arrangements	145
6.5.2 Resource-sharing arrangements	146
6.6 Some constraints to cultivation as a contemporary strategy	150
6.7 Non-pastoral and non-agricultural activities	152
6.8 Summary	156
7. CONTEXTUALIZED ADAPTATION: HEGEMONIC PERSPECTIVES AND LOCAL RESPONSES	158
7.1 Introduction	158
7.2 The politics of adaptation: top-down approaches to development	159
7.2.1 Consideration of governance structures in adaptation	159
7.3 Situated and local-level adaptation practices	161
7.3.1 Recognition of local agency	163
7.4 Summary	167
8. CONCLUSIONS	168
8.1 Starting-point vulnerability: the political ecology of local adaptation	168
8.2 Locating agency in political ecology	170
8.3 Localizing the international perspective on adaptation to climate change	172
8.4 Back to the research questions	173
8.5 Implications for policy and directions for future research	175
8.5.1 Addressing social sources of vulnerability	176
8.5.2 Increasing the negotiation power of the locals	176
8.5.3 Directions for future research	177
9. LIST OF REFERENCES	179

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Interpretation of vulnerability in climate change adaptation research ...	41
Figure 2: Local actors in a broader political-ecology context	48
Figure 3: Map of the study area showing Fentalle <i>Woreda</i>	53
Figure 4: The short season rainfall pattern of Fentalle <i>Woreda</i> (1985–2009).....	55
Figure 5: Cultivated area by crop variety in Upper Awash Valley (1970s)	73
Figure 6: Dry-season pasture land lost to various interventions (in hectares).....	76
Figure 7: The progression of entitlement failure of pastoralists	77
Figure 8: Annual growth of profit (in Birr) in the Metehara Sugar Factory.....	78
Figure 9: The annual rainfall pattern of Upper Awash valley (1966–2004)	80
Figure 10: Number of PSNP beneficiaries in Fentalle <i>Woreda</i> (2007–2009).....	82
Figure 11: Major trends, events and responses in Fentalle <i>Woreda</i>	84
Figure 12: Trends in population number of the Karrayu since 1968.....	95
Figure 13: Migration routes of the Ittu to Karrayu land	96
Figure 14: Summary of the context of livelihood insecurity	99
Figure 15: New forms of mobility by camel herding Karrayu pastoralists	124

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Pair-wise ranking of major sources of livelihood insecurity	83
Table 2: Area recommended for forage development user households.....	93
Table 3: Major seasons and mobility destinations in Fentalle <i>Woreda</i>	102
Table 4: Gendered and age-based roles within Karrayu pastoral households	113
Table 5: An example of camel categorization in the Karrayu community	120
Table 6: Camel herders' roles and responsibilities by age	122
Table 7: Summary of mobility types as practised by the camel-herders	126
Table 8: The different practices and mechanisms for securing resources	148
Table 9: Farming households' responses to constraints on crop production.....	151
Table 10: Number of Karrayu individuals employed in the MSF	154
Table 11: The pastoralists-government understanding of adaptation	166

LIST OF PHOTOS

Photo 1: Key informant interviews with Karrayu elders	64
Photo 2: Partial view of the Metehara Sugar Factory and plantation	74
Photo 3: Degraded pasture in the Karrayu rangeland	86
Photo 4: The practice of farming in Karrayu community.....	131
Photo 5: The new irrigation scheme has increased water availability	138
Photo 6: Fencing off communal grazing areas for farming purposes.....	139
Photo 7: Land preparation by Ittu farmers.....	149
Photo 8: Selling of fuel-wood and charcoal in Metehara town	155

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ANP	Awash National Park
CBDRR	Community Based Disaster Risk Reduction
CRGE	Climate Resilient Green Economy
CSA	Central Statistical Authority
DA	Development Agent
DPPC	Disaster Prevention and Preparedness Commission
EMA	Ethiopian Metrological Agency
EPRDF	Ethiopian People’s Revolutionary Democratic Front
FDRE	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HVA	Hendels-Vereeinging Amsterdam
IPCC	Inter-governmental Panel on Climate Change
MSF	Metehara Sugar Factory
NAPA	National Action Plan for Adaptation
NOPA	Network of Pastoralists Association
PASDEP	Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategic Paper

PSNP	Productive Safety Net Program
SDPRP	Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Paper
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

GLOSSARY

- Abuuruu:*** scouts who supervise pasture and water resources available in a grazing land before migration takes place.
- Khat:*** A kind of plant that is widely grown in Harar and South Western parts of Ethiopia and used as a stimulant
- Damina:*** A traditional *gosa* (clan) leader elected by the council of elders of that particular *gosa*
- Derg:*** Amharic term which literally means committee
- Gada:*** The central institution in the Socio-political way of life of the Oromo. It is a system of classes (sets) that succeed each other every eight years in assuming power and offering political, economic, military and ritual leadership to the Karrayu as well as other Oromo people especially in the period before the external interventions.
- Ganda:*** The smallest unit of local organization that makes reference to a territory in the Karrayu traditional organization
- Kebele:*** The minimal structure of government administration unit, countable to the district. It is introduced during the *Derg* rule in Ethiopia.
- Kalloo:*** The practice of reserving pasture for dry-season among the Karrayu
- Malkaa:*** Watering points along the Awash River. They are also holy grounds and places of *gada* power transfer.

Salfaa: Armed guards that the *gada* leaders recruit and send to protect the Karrayu pastoralists especially in their migration to Haroole and Bulga/Kessem River from hostile neighbours.

Waaqeffataa: One who believes in the Oromo traditional religion called Waaqeffannaa which adheres to the belief in one God called Waaqaa.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have supported me in the process of writing this thesis. Supervisors, research participants, family, and friends have provided important information, advice and support, without which its completion would have been impossible. Here, I wish to thank a few people in particular.

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisor, Professor Dr. Detlef Müller-Mahn, for his intellectual guidance. Professor Müller-Mahn's endless intellectual capacity intertwined with his personal commitment and caring abilities made this journey so interesting and lively. I also admire his sixth sense. He knows when the student needs a push, needs a break, and above all he is able to coach students to discover their own potential. Thank you very much. Additionally, I would like to recognize the contributions of my mentoring members, Professor Dr. Martin Doevenspeck and Professor Dr. Kurt Beck. The critical comments and suggestions of my external examiner, Dr. Ayalew Gebre, were also instrumental in improving the final version of this work.

I would also like to take this opportunity to thank all the staff members of the department of social and political geography at the University of Bayreuth for the wonderful working atmosphere and lively discussions on several occasions. In particular, I benefited a lot from discussions with Dr. Jonathan Everts. Special thanks to Michael Wegner for patiently preparing the maps and graphics. Michael, thank you very much for your brilliance in changing the ideas I told you into convenient graphs and maps. I would also like to thank Dr. Ruth Schubert for her professional editing of the manuscript.

I received a great deal of financial and institutional support for this research. I owe my deepest gratitude to the German Academic Exchange Program (DAAD) for the scholarship that I was granted to pursue my studies. I also thank the Bayreuth Graduate School of African Studies (BIGSAS) for their generous support of my field work. They also covered my travel costs for attending conferences. Without your financial commitment this work would never have been possible. Thank you very much.

The encouragement and support from my family has always been with me throughout my studies. My beloved wife, Johanna Alemu, is a great partner who always earnestly encourages me and enthusiastically follows up the progress of my work. She is, indeed, typical of the strong lady behind her partner's success. Jo, thank you so much for all your support!

Parents and relatives at home and here in Germany also had their role to play in the success of my study. I thank my parents – Getachew Alemu, my father, and Alemitu Dhugo, my mother – above all for giving me the chance to learn and who eagerly anticipated the successful completion of my studies. I am indebted to my parents-in-law, Manfred and Claudia Knoll, and all their family members, for their warm embrace and making me feel at home here in Germany.

